



**University of  
Zurich**<sup>UZH</sup>

**Zurich Open Repository and  
Archive**

University of Zurich  
University Library  
Strickhofstrasse 39  
CH-8057 Zurich  
[www.zora.uzh.ch](http://www.zora.uzh.ch)

---

Year: 2009

---

**La Réforme en France et en Italie. Contacts, comparaisons et contrastes.**  
**Edited by Philip Benedict, Silvana Seidel Menchi and Alain Tallon.**  
**(Collection de l'École française de Rome, 384.) Pp. iv+671. Rome: École**  
**française de Rome, 2007. 978 2 7283 0790 6; 0223 5099**

Campi, Emidio

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0022046908007082>

Posted at the Zurich Open Repository and Archive, University of Zurich

ZORA URL: <https://doi.org/10.5167/uzh-154371>

Journal Article

Published Version

Originally published at:

Campi, Emidio (2009). La Réforme en France et en Italie. Contacts, comparaisons et contrastes. Edited by Philip Benedict, Silvana Seidel Menchi and Alain Tallon. (Collection de l'École française de Rome, 384.) Pp. iv+671. Rome: École française de Rome, 2007. 978 2 7283 0790 6; 0223 5099. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 60(2):374-376.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0022046908007082>

some reflections on the broader significance of the fresh and often innovative research it contains, for what is painted here is a picture of a complex pattern of Catholic reform, in some ways parallel to that seen elsewhere in Europe, but in other ways very much a product of local forces.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

ELAINE FULTON

*La Réforme en France et en Italie. Contacts, comparaisons et contrastes.* Edited by Philip Benedict, Silvana Seidel Menchi and Alain Tallon. (Collection de l'École française de Rome, 384.) Pp. iv + 671. Rome: École française de Rome, 2007.

978 2 7283 0790 6; 0223 5099

JEH (60) 2009; doi:10.1017/S0022046908007082

The volume consists of a collection of essays linked to the international conference organised by its editors and held in Rome on the 27–29 October 2005. Although in recent decades scholars have turned their attention increasingly to the French and Italian Reformation, little has been published on this subject with a comparative perspective that seeks to recognise connections, similarities and differences, as well as to make historical generalisations. This volume helps to fill that gap and constitutes a welcome addition to the field of Reformation studies.

The thirty-one essays comprising *La Réforme en France et en Italie* are thematically organised into eight sections and preceded by a thorough introduction in which the three editors present arguments and justifications for their chosen comparative approach. In an attempt to avoid excessive concentration on theory and methodology at the expense of substantial empirical work, they asked Euan Cameron to review the historiography of the subject, and then explore areas where comparisons are especially fruitful, a task admirably accomplished.

The first section looks at the diffusion of Evangelical and Protestant ideas. Andrew Pettegree and Susanna Peyronel Rambaldi look at the role of printed books and pamphlets in disseminating heterodox ideas, while Jean-François Gilmont investigates other techniques (placards, music, theatre) and proposes a scheme for the development of Protestant propaganda in the two countries.

The second section focuses on the networks of dissent. Federica Ambrosini depicts a striking prosopography of the Italian religious dissent that spread widely even in the remote areas of Calabria and Sicily, indicating that its theological orientation was far more diverse than is generally assumed. On the French side, Jonathan Reid advances the hypothesis that the key catalyst in the formation of French Evangelical networks was the ministry of Evangelical clerics operating within the Catholic Church. Unfortunately, no attempt is made to seek to explain historical differences or peculiarities, weighing and eventually isolating variables responsible for the respective particular conditions.

The third section provides insights into the innovations within the Catholic Church of France and Italy and their limits, with contributions from Mark Greengrass, Nicole Lemaitre, Massimo Firpo and Simon Ditchfield. The latter two essays in particular show that Jedin's thesis of Catholic Reform and Counter Reformation is still quite controversial. This section also signals cases of contacts, exchanges and cross-influences between the two countries. Stefano Dall'Aglio discusses the reception of Savonarola in France. Bernard Aikema provides an

overview of the present debate on the relationship between art and Reformation. Chiara Franceschini surveys the ways in which images of purgatory and expectations of eschatological events were employed in religious debates. Giorgio Caravale details further aspects of Francesco Pucci's relationships with France.

The collection's fourth section studies the response of political elites to the spread of evangelical ideas. Pierroberto Scaramella proffers an analysis of the elites within southern Italy, John Martin of those within northern Italy and Hugues Daussey of those in the kingdom of France. Eleonora Belligni details the efforts of René de France in support of Italian Calvinism. Alain Tallon shows how the *parti français* sided opportunistically with Italian Catholic Church leaders in the suppression of religious dissent. The section is rounded off with Philip Benedict's considerations of the diversity of the French and Italian historiographies.

Scholars interested in the history of ideas will appreciate section five on the symbolism of religious changes. Denis Crouzet covers a wide range of examples sharply attributed to two different chronological periods. Olivier Christin offers a broad definition of the genre ranging from hymn-singing in the vernacular to disturbance of public worship and iconoclasm. By contrast, the symbolism of religious change in Italy is characterised, as Silvana Seidel Menchi notes, by the open confession of the Gospel, the acceptance of persecution and martyrdom and the flight from what the sources call 'popery'.

Insights into the organisation of the repression of Protestant heresy can be found in the sixth section with essays by William Monter on France and Andrea Del Col on Italy. The closing comparative examination of the subject, by Elena Brambilla, leaves us for the moment with more questions than certitudes as to the efficacy of the two different systems of repression.

Refugee churches and exile centres are the subject of section seven. Simonetta Adorni Braccesi provides an overview of the Italian and Philip Benedict of the French refuge. Robert Kingdon examines the ways in which discipline was adopted by both French and Italian Protestants. Mario Turchetti approaches the issue of Calvin's opinion of the 'Italians'.

Ecclesiology serves as the focus of the final section. Marc Venard provides a broad overview of the basic differences between the Roman Catholic and Protestant ecclesiologies without losing sight of the Erasmian vision of what the Church should be. Adriano Prosperi's contribution includes reconsideration of the still controversial question of the relationship between early Catholic impulses for reform and Luther's Reformation, of the contacts of the Italian dissidents with their French counterparts, and of the heterogenesis of the two movements.

As is often the case in lengthy collections, the essays are of varying quality. Many are based on careful examination of sources, some inevitably revisit territory already surveyed and a few exhibit the author's particular bias. Nearly every one provides important scholarship and represents an exemplary cross-section of current research. To be sure, by no means can the volume claim to be a comprehensive treatment of the French and the Italian Reformation. For example, a regrettable gap in the topics covered is the theological strains. Relating theology to ecclesiology, Church-State relations and the arts, would have enriched the collection significantly. However, the fields to be covered were so vast, and the need of a representative assortment so exacting, that hard decisions presumably had to be made in order to keep the collection at a reasonable length. All in all, *La Réforme en France et en Italie*

shows that the comparative approach is rich and important. This hefty volume is an impressive contribution that will promote both wider and deeper research.

UNIVERSITY OF ZÜRICH

EMIDIO CAMPI

*From Judaism to Calvinism. The life and writings of Immanuel Tremellius (c. 1510–1580).* By Kenneth Austin (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xxiv + 230. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2007. £55. 978 0 7546 5233 5  
*JEH* (60) 2009; doi:10.1017/S0022046908006088

Immanuel Tremellius was born a Jew in Ferrara in about 1510. Under the influence of Italian evangelism, he converted to Christianity in Italy in the late 1530s or early 1540s. In 1542 his flight from Italy to Germany made clear his commitment to the Reformed branch of Christianity. From then until his death in 1580 he taught Hebrew at various Reformed schools and universities in northern Europe. He was (and is) best known as a biblical translator. In 1569 he published a translation of the New Testament from the Syriac; and his translation of the Old Testament from the Hebrew, which first appeared in 1575, had gone through a total of thirty-four European editions by 1715.

This book is the first biography of Tremellius since the nineteenth century and the first ever in English. Austin sets out to establish his subject as ‘a much more important figure than his modern reputation would suggest’ and argues that Tremellius’ life provides ‘a valuable case-study through which we may come to a better understanding of the religious culture of the sixteenth century’ (p. vii). And indeed Tremellius’ professional encounters over the course of his itinerant career read like a ‘Who’s Who’ of sixteenth-century religion – including Alessandro Farnese (the future Pope Paul III), Reginald Pole, Peter Martyr Vermigli, Jean Calvin, Martin Bucer and Thomas Cranmer. His career in northern Europe, specifically, sheds new light on how Reformed churches, schools and universities operated as an international network.

Austin’s research is also impressive. Though forced into speculation regarding much of Tremellius’ early life, he backs up his conclusions with as much evidence as possible. Material concerning Tremellius’ years at Heidelberg is more plentiful. From student lecture notes the author is able to piece together a description of Tremellius’ teaching style and content. Similarly, a close examination of his translations of the New and Old Testaments reveals much about his goals and methods as a translator of sacred Scripture. Through these analyses, Austin draws his most important conclusion: that in his teaching and translation Tremellius’ primary concern was not to defend the theology of the Reformed faith, but rather to provide his students and readers with the most literal and linguistically accurate translation of the text. His lectures and biblical annotations rarely, if ever, delved into the realm of confessional polemic.

Tremellius’ irenic approach suggests that the so-called confessional age may not have been quite as avidly confessional as scholars have assumed. In the end, however, one cannot help wondering if he was the exception that proved the rule. While Austin’s biography does provide an valuable and illuminating case study of the intellectual culture of the sixteenth century, his contention that Tremellius ‘made a significant contribution to the early modern period’ (p. 175) is not quite convincing.